

DATE: March 7, 2019
TO: Mayor and City Council
VIA: City Manager
FROM: Assistant City Manager
SUBJECT: Construction Contract Award
19-002: Veterans Memorial



RECOMMENDED ACTION

Award the construction contract for project # 19-002 Veterans Memorial in an amount not to exceed \$1,450,904 to Surfaces Group, LLC of Marietta.

BUDGET IMPACT

Funds in the amount of \$1,250,000 were budgeted over a two-year period to complete the improvements proposed with an anticipated partnership and grant sources making up the balance of funding during a subsequent fiscal year. Allocation of \$700,000 in reserves (from the sale of the Buice property) is being requested to prefund the entire project and avoid phasing its construction and fulfill all of the proposed project scope in one contract.

DISCUSSION

The project to relocate the Veterans Memorial monument was initiated a few years ago as plans for the Broadstone development on the Buice Center and town green began to take shape. The improvements proposed for the town green and memorial location were such that the monument would need to be relocated to a more prominent place and have its own identity, separate from the other open space elements.

Planning and design for the new location commenced in the fall of 2018 as the sale of the Buice property became a reality in November. Bid documents were assembled by Precision Planning and the project advertised for construction in January. Five plan holders expressed interest in the project with four bids received on the 21st of February. The bid values ranged from \$1.3 million to just under \$2 million as shown in the table below.

February 21, 2019 Bid Tabulation:

| Architect: Precision Planning, Inc. 400 Pike Boulevard, Lawrenceville, GA 30046 Telephone: 770-338-8000 | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--------------------------------|--------------|--------------|------------|----------|---------------|--------------|------------------|------------------|-----------------|
| Owner: City of Sugar Hill 5039 West Broad Street - Sugar Hill, GA 30518 Telephone: 770-9456734 | | | | | | | | | | |
| Project: Sugar Hill Veterans Memorial Plaza | | | | | | | | | | |
| Bid Date/Time: 02-21-19 @ 2:00pm | | | | | | | | | | |
| # | Bidders | Add. 1 Rec'd | Add. 2 Rec'd | Bidr. Cert | Bid Bond | GC Qual. A305 | SC List G705 | GC Non-Col. Aff. | SC Non-Col. Aff. | Total Base Bid |
| | Blue Frog, LLC | | | | | | | | | \$ - |
| | Diversified Construction of GA | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | - | ✓ | | \$ 1,339,000.00 |
| | Multiplex, LLC | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | - | - | ✓ | | \$ 1,933,000.00 |
| | Surfaces Group | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | \$ 1,450,904.00 |
| | Triscapes, Inc. | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | \$ 1,989,899.87 |
| | | | | | | | | | | \$ - |
| | | | | | | | | | | \$ - |
| | | | | | | | | | | \$ - |

Each of the bidders was required to submit on the appropriate forms, their itemized bid amount, certifications, and qualifications statement. After reviewing the documents provided in each bid, it was determined that the apparent low-bidder, Diversified Construction of Georgia, did NOT use the correct bid form, leaving out key components of the project in their bid package. Thus, their bid was determined to be non-responsive and was rejected.

Subsequently, the design team reviewed all of the other bids and determined that the lowest, responsible, responsive bid was from Surfaces Group in the amount of \$1,450,904. The city has had good experience with Surfaces Group, who completed the community garden parking lot improvements and site work associated with the downtown gateway sign.

With the base bid amount exceeding the budgeted cost of the project, staff met with Surfaces Group and determined a number of project items that could be reduced or deferred to another project to bring the price equal to the budget number. These changes include consideration of concrete pavers in lieu of granite pavers, consideration of an alternate to the pool coatings and removal of larger items in the lighting package such as the LED benches and bollards. After reconsideration of the nature and prominence of the location as well as the need to honor the purpose of the project, staff is recommending keeping the scope intact.

Should Council determine that a full award of the bid amount is warranted, staff is still recommending a value analysis exercise be engaged to ensure that additional savings or value cannot be provided prior to final contract.

Attachment

Recommendation Letter – Precision Planning



March 4, 2019

Mr. Troy Besseche, P.E.
Assistant City Manager
City of Sugar Hill
5039 West Broad Street
Sugar Hill, GA 30518

Re: Sugar Hill Veterans Memorial Plaza
Proposal for Bid Phase Services

Mr. Besseche,

Upon review of the bids received and evaluating the most qualified, responsive and responsible low bidder, we recommend that the Contract for Construction of the **Sugar Hill Veterans Memorial Plaza, IFB 19-002**, be awarded to the Bidder, **Surfaces Group, LLC**. We recommend that this contract be awarded for the Base Bid amount of **\$1,450,904.00** plus any alternates as selected by the Owner.

Based upon the contract requirement for bidders to be the **most qualified, responsive and responsible** bidder submitting the lowest bid, we offer the following evaluation of the lowest bid received:

The lowest bid received on February 21, 2019 for the above-referenced project was submitted by **Diversified Construction of Georgia, Inc.** Upon our review of their Bid Package, it was determined this Bidder did not meet the requirements for the most responsive and responsible Bidder. The following outlines our evaluation of the bid requirements established for this project.

- A. Documents required to be included in the submitted Bid Package submitted on 03-31-15:
 - 1. Bid Form: **Bidder did not submit the correct Bid Form per Addendum #2 Issued on 02/18/19. Bid form submitted is missing allowance pay item #8 Natural Gas Flame.**
 - 2. Bidder's Certification: Received and complete.
 - 3. Bid Bond: Received and complete.
 - 4. Power of Attorney: Received and complete.
 - 5. A305 Qualifications: **Bidder's Qualifications Statement A305 was received but was incomplete. Bidder did not respond to A305 question 3.3 regarding failure to complete construction contracts within the past 5 years. Bidder did not submit page 3 of the A305 Contractor's Qualification Statement.**
 - 6. G705 Subcontractors List: **Bidder submitted a blank G705 List of Subcontractors document. No subcontractors have been provided.**
 - 7. Non-Collusion Affidavit: Received and complete.

- B. Project References and Qualifications provided:
 - 1. **Project references of comparable size, type and scope were not provided. Projects provided were HVAC modifications, building renovations and new building construction type projects. References do not indicate any experience on public plaza or water feature types of projects.**

Mr. Troy Besseche, PE | City of Sugar Hill
Sugar Hill Veterans Memorial Plaza, IFB 19-002 (Bid Recommendation)
March 4, 2019
Page 2

2. As of the date of this letter PPI has requested references from (7) seven of the references provided by the bidder with the following results.
 - a. Three (3) reference check requests came back with positive feedback.
 - b. Three (3) reference check requests have not responded.
 - c. **One (1) reference check has come back with negative comments about the Contractor's performance and stated they would not use this Contractor again. Reference stated they did not think the Contractor had ever completed a project similar to theirs before and did not complete the project on schedule.**
 - d. **All four reference checks indicated that a change in staff was made to the Jobsite Superintendent position during construction or that multiple superintendents were involved.**

After reviewing the insufficient bid package of the lowest bidder, we requested confirmation and direction from the City to proceed with reviewing the second lowest bid package provided by **Surfaces Group, LLC**. Based on the direction received from the City, we proceeded with our evaluation of the second low bid with the following comments:

- A. Documents required to be included in the submitted Bid Package submitted on 03-31-15:
 1. Bid Form: Received and complete.
 2. Bidder's Certification: Received and complete.
 3. Bid Bond: Received and complete.
 4. Power of Attorney: Received and complete.
 5. A305 Qualifications: Received and complete.
 6. G705 Subcontractors List: Received and complete.
 7. Non-Collusion Affidavit: Received and complete.
- B. Project References and Qualifications provided:
 1. As of the date of this letter PPI has requested references from (8) eight of the references provided by the bidder with the following results.
 - i. Four (4) reference check requests came back with positive feedback.
 - ii. Four (4) reference check requests have not responded.

Based on the information indicated above, we recommend moving forward with the contract award to the lowest, most qualified, responsible Bidder, **Surfaces Group, LLC**.

Should you have any questions, or if there is any item that requires further clarification, please do not hesitate to call me at 770-338-8142.

Sincerely,



B. Kent Snyder II, NCARB, AIA
Assistant Vice President

BKS/kb

G:\DOCUMENT\18\A18-221 Sugar Hill Veterans Memorial Plaza\1560 Bidding\Recommendation to Award\Recommendation Letter 03.04.19.docx

Attachments for:

- Reference Check Questionnaires – Diversified Construction of Georgia, Inc.
- Reference Check Questionnaires – Surfaces Group, LLC.